

Alexander Høgsberg Tetzlaff
Cornelia Baciu

**EUROPEAN PERSPECTIVES
ON THE GLOBAL
RETURN OF
NUCLEAR WEAPONS**

DJØF PUBLISHING
IN COOPERATION WITH THE
CENTRE FOR MILITARY STUDIES

European Perspectives
on the Global
Return of
Nuclear Weapons

Alexander Høgsberg Tetzlaff
Cornelia Baci

European Perspectives
on the
Global Return of
Nuclear Weapons



Djøf Publishing
In cooperation with the
Centre for Military Studies
2023

European Perspectives
on the Global
Return of Nuclear Weapons

Alexander Høgsberg Tetzlaff & Cornelia Baci
European Perspectives on the Global Return of Nuclear Weapons
Legal Considerations for
Acquisition and Procurement

© 2023 by Djøf Publishing and the Centre for Military Studies
All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any
form or by any means – electronic, mechanical,
photocopying, recording or otherwise – without
the prior written permission of the Publisher.

*This publication is peer reviewed according to the standards
set by the Danish Ministry of Higher Education and Science.*

Cover: Kelly Chigozie Kjelsø Arazu
Print: Ecograf, Brabrand

Printed in Denmark 2023

ISBN 978-87-574-5777-3

Djøf Publishing
Gothersgade 137
1123 København K

Telefon: 39 13 55 00
e-mail: forlag@djoef.dk
www.djoef-forlag.dk

Editor's Preface

The publications in this series present new research on defence and security policy of relevance to Danish and international decision-makers. The series is a continuation of the studies previously published as CMS Reports. It is a central dimension of the research-based services that the Centre for Military Studies provides for the Danish Ministry of Defence and the political parties behind the Danish defence agreement.

The Centre for Military Studies and its partners are subject to the University of Copenhagen guidelines for research-based services, including academic freedom and the arm's length principle. As they are the result of independent research, the studies do not express the views of the Danish Government, the Danish Armed Forces, or other authorities.

Our studies aim to provide new knowledge that is both academically sound and practically actionable. The studies in the series have all undergone external peer review, and they all conclude with recommendations to Danish decision-makers. It is our hope that these publications will both inform and strengthen Danish and international policy formulation as well as the democratic debate on defence and security policy, in particular in Denmark.

The Centre for Military Studies is a research centre at the Department of Political Science, University of Copenhagen. The centre conducts research into security and defence policy as well as military strategy.

Read more about the centre, its activities, and other publications at:
<https://cms.polsci.ku.dk/english/>

Copenhagen, June 2023
Kristian Soby Kristensen

Table of Contents

List of Figures, Tables and Text boxes	9
Abstract and Recommendations	11
Recommendations	12
Increase public and parliamentary debate on nuclear issues in Denmark	12
Focus on strategic issues in Danish defense planning	13
Options for Danish diplomacy on nuclear issues	13
Resumé og anbefalinger	15
Anbefalinger	16
Øge den offentlige og parlamentariske debat om atomare spørgsmål i Danmark ..	17
Fokus på strategiske spørgsmål i den danske forsvarsplanlægning	17
Muligheder for dansk diplomati i atomare spørgsmål	18
1. Introduction	21
2. The European Problem: Erosion of Strategic Stability and Arms Control	25
2.1. The Absence of Crisis Stability and Arms Race Stability	27
3. European Nuclear Postures: Germany, France and the UK	39
3.1. Germany: Europe's Ambivalent Nuclear-Sharing State	39
3.2. United Kingdom: Europe's Reluctant Nuclear Power	42
3.3. France: The Independent European Nuclear Power	47
4. Key Conceptual Debates on the Future European Nuclear Order	53
4.1. What Does Deterrence Mean in the Third Nuclear Age?	54
4.2. How to Prevent a Nuclear Catastrophe?	57
4.3. Instability Management	59
4.4. A Future "No First Use" Policy?	62
4.5. European Voices in the Nuclear Order	65

5. Conclusions and Recommendations	67
5.1. Recommendations	69
5.2. Increase public and parliamentary debate on nuclear issues in Denmark	70
5.3. Focus on strategic issues in Danish defense planning	70
5.4. Options for Danish diplomacy on nuclear issues	71
6. List of References	73

List of Figures, Tables and Text boxes

Tables

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. Chronological list of treaties limiting nuclear weapons | 35 |
| 2. European countries and their postures on relevant nuclear subjects | 50 |

Text boxes

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. Common nuclear phrases explained | 29 |
| 2. The nuclear deterrence problematique | 31 |
| 3. US Nuclear Posture Reviews | 63 |
| 4. The onset of a new nuclear age | 55 |

- Recognizing the strategic effects of Danish conventional procurement decisions—especially if made in conjunction/cooperation with allies and partners
- Assessing the (local) deterrence and vulnerability effects of Danish procurement decisions (e.g., long-range strike missiles)
- Contemplating the effects of potentially increasing the Danish contribution to NATO's mixed deterrence posture (e.g., a Danish contribution to NATO ballistic missile defense capability)

5.4. Options for Danish diplomacy on nuclear issues

Current tendencies paint a bleak picture regarding future arms control agreements and other diplomatic efforts aimed at managing the role of nuclear weapons. Still, Denmark, as both a signatory to the Non-Proliferation Treaty and as member and beneficiary of NATO's nuclear deterrent, has an interest in as well as an obligation to working for increased strategic stability and nuclear security. Initiatives supporting such aims could include:

- Promoting diplomatic discussions on nuclear issues among small non-nuclear NATO states that share Denmark's geopolitical position, while simultaneously being exposed to the erosion of strategic stability in Europe. This would provide a venue for knowledge exchange and a forum for deliberating stabilizing initiatives among likeminded countries.
- Engaging global partners to build momentum and share the responsibility for renewed nuclear arms control agreements and regimes with wider reach when the conditions become more conducive to reengagement between the US, Russia, and China on strategic stability issues.
- Considering the use of Denmark's prospective 2025-26 seat at the UN Security Council, which precedes the next Non-Proliferation Treaty Review Conference in 2027 to promote renewed arms control efforts.

Denne bog er omfattet af lov om ophavsret og må ikke videregives – herunder udlånes, sælges eller kopieres – i digital form.

Indholdet må alene anvendes af licenstagere i henhold til de til enhver tid gældende licensbetingelser.

© Djøf Forlag

6

List of References

- Acton, James M. "Escalation through Entanglement: How the Vulnerability of Command-and-Control Systems Raises the Risks of an Inadvertent Nuclear War." *International Security* 43, no. 1 (2018), 56-99.
- Acton, James M. "Reclaiming Strategic Stability." In *Strategic Stability: Contending Interpretations*, edited by Elbridge A. Colby and Michael S. Gerson Carlisle: US Army War College Press, 2013.
- Afina, Yasmin, Calum Inverarity, and Beyza Unal. *Ensuring Cyber Resilience in NATO's Command, Control and Communication Systems*. London: Chatham House, the Royal Institute of International Affairs, July 2020.
- Allen, Aaron. *Europe and the Future of Nuclear Strategic Stability*. Washington, Center for European Policy Analysis, December 2021.
- Arms Control Association. "The European Phased Adaptive Approach at a Glance." Accessed March 9, 2023. <https://www.armscontrol.org/factsheets/Phasedadaptiveapproach>.
- Arms Control Association. "U.S. Nuclear Modernization Programs." Accessed March 9, 2023. <https://www.armscontrol.org/factsheets/USNuclearModernization>.
- Arms Control Association. "US Russian Nuclear Arms Control Agreements at a Glance." Accessed March 9, 2023. <https://www.armscontrol.org/factsheets/USRussiaNuclearAgreements>.
- Arndt, Clara, Liviu Horovitz, Claudia Major, Jonas Schneider, and Lydia Wachs. *Euro-Atlantic Concerns regarding a US "Sole Purpose" Policy*. Berlin: German Institute for International and Security Affairs, December 4, 2021.
- Bhaskar, Uday C. "Nuclear Weapons and No First Use: Need for Strategic Restraint." *Strategic Analysis* XXII, no. 10 (1999).
- Borger, Julian, and Dan Sabbagh. "UK Military Vaults Upgraded to Store New US Nuclear Weapons." *The Guardian*, April 12, 2022.
- Boutwell, Jeffrey. *The German Nuclear Dilemma*. Cornell: Cornell University Press, 1990.

- Brustlein, Corentin. *The Erosion of Strategic Stability and the Future of Arms Control in Europe*. Paris: French Institute of International Relations, November 2018.
- Colby, Elbridge A., and Michael S. Gerson. *Strategic Stability: Contending Interpretations*. Carlisle: US Army War College Press, 2013.
- Colby, Elbridge A. "Defining Strategic Stability: Reconciling Stability and Deterrence." In *Strategic Stability: Contending Interpretations*, edited by Elbridge A. Colby and Michael S. Gerson. Carlisle: US Army War College Press, 2013.
- Conrad, Naomi. "In Germany, Gridlock over Nuclear-Capable Fighter Jet." *Deutsche Welle*, October 1, 2020.
- Danish State Department. Press Meeting in Danish State Department, 6 March 2022. The Conservative Party leader Søren Pape and Jakob Elleman Jensen, party leader of Venstre, Denmark's Liberal Party. <https://www.stm.dk/presse/pressemoedearkiv/pressemoede-soendag-den-6-marts-2022/>.
- Dasgupta, Prateek. "Why Did France Leave NATO at the Height of the Cold War?" *Medium*, April 26, 2022.
- Episkopos, Mark. "Russia's Crazy Nuclear War Strategy: Escalation...to De-escalate?" *The National Interest*, March 19, 2021.
- Erästö, Tytti. *Between the Shield and the Sword: NATO's Overlooked Missile Defense Dilemma*. San Francisco: Ploughshares Fund Study Report No. 3, July 2017.
- European Council. "A Strategic Compass for a Stronger EU Security and Defence in the Next Decade." Accessed March 9, 2023. <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2022/03/21/a-strategic-compass-for-a-stronger-eu-security-and-defence-in-the-next-decade/>.
- European Leadership Network. "Statement by the Euro-Atlantic Security Leadership Group: Advancing Strategic Stability in the Euro-Atlantic Region." Accessed March 9, 2023. <https://www.europeanleadershipnetwork.org/group-statement/statement-by-the-euro-atlantic-security-leadership-group-ea-slg-advancing-strategic-stability-in-the-euro-atlantic-region-2021-and-beyond/>.
- European Research Council Project. "Towards a Third Nuclear Age: Strategic Conventional Weapons and the Next Revolution in the Global Nuclear Order (NUCLEARREV)." Accessed March 9 2023. <https://thethirdnuclearage.com/>.
- Ewers-Peters, Nele M., and Cornelia Baciu. "Differentiated Integration and Role Conceptions in Multilateral Security Orders: A Comparative Study of France, Germany, Ireland and Romania." *Defence Studies* 22, no. 4 (2022): 666-8.
- Fasola, Nicolo. "The Shaky Grounds of Russia's 'Escalate to De-Escalate' Doctrine." In *Challenges to NATO's Nuclear Strategy*, edited by Andrea Gilli, 3-16. NDC Research Paper No 22, NATO Defence College, 2021.
- Futter, Andrew. *The United Kingdom and the Future of Nuclear Weapons*. London: Rowman and Littlefield 2016.

- Futter, Andrew. "Strategic Non-Nuclear Weapons and the Onset of a Third Nuclear Age." *European Journal of International Security* 6, no. 3 (February 2021): 1-21.
- Gilli, Andrea. (ed.) *Challenges to NATO's Nuclear Strategy*. NDC Research Paper No 22, NATO Defence College, 27-34.
- Gottemoeller, Rose. "Russia Is Updating Their Nuclear Weapons: What Does That Mean for the Rest of Us?" *Carnegie Endowment for International Peace*, January 29, 2020.
- Government of the United Kingdom. *Global Britain in a Competitive Age: The Integrated Review of Security, Defence, Development and Foreign Policy*. London: Government of the United Kingdom, March 2021.
- Government of the United Kingdom. *The Future of the United Kingdom's Nuclear Deterrent*. London: Government of the United Kingdom, December 2006.
- Government of the United Kingdom. *Securing Britain in an Age of Uncertainty: The Strategic Defence and Security Review*. London: Government of the United Kingdom, October 2010.
- Greenham Common Protest: The National Archives. Accessed March 9, 2023. <https://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/education/resources/cold-war-on-file/greenham-common-protest/>.
- Gregory, James. "Putin: Russia to Station Nuclear Weapons in Belarus – BBC News." Accessed March 27, 2023, BBC News. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-65077687>.
- Hadley, Greg. "55 Democrats Urge Biden to Adopt 'No First Use' Nuclear Policy." *Air & Space Forces Magazine*, January 26, 2022.
- Haute Couverture, Benjamin, Emmanuelle Maitre, and Bruno Tertrais. *The Future of Strategic Stability*. Paris, Fondation pour la Recherche Stratégique No. 7, March 2021.
- Horowitz, Liviu, and Lydia Wachs. *Russia's Nuclear Threats in the War against Ukraine, SWP Comment*. Berlin: German Institute for International and Security Affairs, April 2022.
- Isachenkov, Vladimir. "New Russian Policy Allows Use of Atomic Weapons against Non-Nuclear Strike." *Defence News*, June 2, 2020.
- Isachenkov, Vladimir. "Putin Signs Bill to Suspend Last Nuclear Arms Pact with US." *AP News*. Accessed March 9 2023. <https://apnews.com/article/russia-us-nuclear-pact-suspension-ukraine-putin-c579b7562fb816d899e037d1d271a8c5>.
- IISS, "The US Nuclear Posture Review in limbo." *Strategic Comments* 28, no. 4 (2022), v-vi.
- Johnson, James. "Inadvertent Escalation in the Age of Intelligence Machines: A New Model for Nuclear Risk in the Digital Age." *European Journal of International Security* 7, no. 3.
- Kristensen, Hans M., and Matt Korda. "United Kingdom Nuclear Weapons 2021." In *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists* (2021). doi: 10.1080/00963402.2021.1912309.

- Kristensen, Kristian Soby, and Niels Byrjalsen. *Efter freden: Ukrainekrigens betydning for dansk og europæisk sikkerhed*. Copenhagen: Centre for Military Studies, 2022.
- Kunertova, Dominika. *New Missiles, Eroding Norms: European Options after the Demise of the INF Treaty*. CMS report. Copenhagen: Centre for Military Studies, April 2021.
- Körber Stiftung. *Körber Strategic Stability Initiative. Digital Working Sessions I-III*, 2021. https://ifsh.de/file/research/project_documents/20200817_KSSI_Summary_DWS_I-III.pdf.
- Lunn, Simon. "NATO Nuclear Policy Reflections on Lisbon and Looking Ahead to the DDP." *Nuclear Threat Initiative*, 2011.
- Lunn, Simon, and Ian Kearns. *ELN Background Brief NATO Nuclear Policy after Lisbon. The Summit Documents and Way Ahead*. Report prepared for the Meeting of the European Leadership Network. (January 2011). <https://www.europeanleadershipnetwork.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/NATO-Paper-by-Ian-Kearns-and-Simon-Lunn.pdf>.
- Lutsch, Andreas. *The Persistent Legacy. Germany's Place in the Nuclear Order*. NPIHP Working Paper. Washington: Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars, May 2015.
- Macias, Amanda. "China Is Rapidly Expanding Its Nuclear Arsenal, Pentagon Says in New Report." *CNBC*, November 3, 2021.
- Maitre, Emmanuelle. *Nuclear Deterrence in Europe: Points of Convergence, Singularities and Prospects for Cooperation*. Paris, Foundation pour la Recherche Stratégique, January, 2021.
- Maitre, Emmanuelle. *NATO, the F35 and European Nuclear Dilemmas*. Paris Foundation pour la Recherche Stratégique, February 2016.
- Mattelaer, Alexander. *Rethinking Nuclear Deterrence: A European Perspective*. Brussels: CSDS Policy Brief, Brussels School of Governance—Centre for Security, Diplomacy and Strategy, May 2022.
- Mead, Walter R. "The Return of Geopolitics: The Revenge of the Revisionist Powers." *Foreign Affairs* 93, no. 3 (May/June, 2014): 69-74, 75-79.
- Military.com. "Why Russia's Hypersonic Missiles Can't Be Seen on Radar." Accessed March 9, 2023. <https://www.military.com/equipment/weapons/why-russias-hypersonic-missiles-cant-be-seen-radar.html>.
- Mount, Adam. *What Is the Sole Purpose of U.S. Nuclear Weapons?* Washington: Federation of American Scientists, September 2021.
- Mills, Claire. *Nuclear Weapons at a Glance: France*. London: The House of Commons Library, July 2022.
- Missile Defense Advocacy Alliance. "Germany: Background." accessed March 9, 2023. https://missiledefenseadvocacy.org/intl_cooperation/germany/.
- Müller, Harald. *Nuclear Weapons and German Interests: An Attempt at Redefinition*. Peace Research Institute Frankfurt (PRIF), report no. 55/2000.

- Nielsen, Kristian L. "Beware the Folly of Pride: Europe, Trump and the Enduring Need for the Transatlantic Alliance." *L'Europe en Formation* 382, no. 1 (2017): 63-81.
- North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO). "NATO Ballistic Missile Defence: factsheet." Accessed March 9, 2023. https://www.nato.int/nato_static_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf_2016_07/20160630_1607-factsheet-bmd-en.pdf.
- North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO). "NATO's Nuclear Deterrence Policy and Forces." Accessed, March 9, 2023. https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/topics_50068.htm#:~:text=The%20fundamental%20purpose%20of%20NATO's,a%20world%20without%20nuclear%20weapons.
- North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO). "Relations with the European Union." Accessed March 9, 2023. https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natolive/topics_49217.htm.
- Olsen, B. Kim. "Zeitenwende." *Danish Institute for International Studies*, August 17, 2022.
- Onderco, Michal, and Michal Smetana. "German Views on US Nuclear Weapons in Europe: Public and Elite Perspectives." *European Security* 30, no. 4 (2021): 630-48.
- Panda, Ankit and Vipin Narang. "Sole Purpose Is Not No First Use: Nuclear Weapons and Declaratory Policy." *War on the Rocks*, February 22, 2021.
- Portela, Clara. "Weapons of Mass Debate – Spain: A Dispassionate Supporter of Nuclear Deterrence." *Institut Montaigne*, July 15, 2021.
- Rumer, Eugene. "The Primakov (Not Gerasimov) Doctrine in Action," Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, June 5, 2019.
- Salisbury, Daniel. "Seventy Years of British Nuclear Debates (a short overview)." In *The United Kingdom and the Future of Nuclear Weapons*, edited by Andrew Futter. London: Rowman and Littlefield, 2016.
- Sorg, Alexander. "Nuclear Weapons in Germany: Mitigating a Hypothetical End of the Nuclear-Sharing Arrangements." In *Challenges to NATO's Nuclear Strategy*, edited by Andrea Gilli, 27-34. NDC Research Paper No 22, NATO Defence College, December, 2021.
- Sprenger, Sebastian. "Germany to Buy F-35 Warplanes for Nuclear Deterrence." *Defense News*, March 14, 2022.
- Tannenwald, Nina, and James M. Acton. *Meeting the Challenge of the New Nuclear Age*. Cambridge, MA: American Academy of Arts & Sciences, 2018.
- Tertrais, Bruno. *French Nuclear Deterrence Policy, Forces, and Future: A Handbook*. Paris: Fondation pour la Recherche Stratégique, February 2020.
- The French Government. *Defence and National Security Strategic Review 2017*, 6. Paris: The French Government, October 2017.
- The French Government. *The French White Paper on Defence and National Security*. Paris: The French Government, July 2008.
- HM Government, *Global Britain in a competitive age. The Integrated Review of Security, Defence, Development and Foreign Policy* (London, March 2021).

- Van Hoof, Paul, Lotje Boswinkel, and Tim Sweijs. *Shifting Sands of Strategic Stability: Towards a New Arms Control Agenda*. The Hague: The Hague Centre for Strategic Studies, February 2022.
- Vicente, Adérito. "European Nuclear Deterrence and Security Cooperation: Post-Brexit Relations and Challenges." In *Peace, Security and Defence Cooperation in Post-Brexit Europe – Risks and Opportunities*, edited by Cornelia-Adriana Baciu and John Doyle. Cham: Springer, 2019.
- Walton, C. Dale, and Colin S. Gray. "Looking beyond Cold Warriors and Nuclear Weapons." In *Strategic Stability: Contending Interpretations*, edited by Elbridge A. Colby and Michael S. Gerson. Carlisle: US Army War College Press, 2013.
- Woolf, Amy F. *U.S. Nuclear Weapons Policy: Considering "No First Use."* Congressional Research Service Insight. IN10553, Version 11. 2022.
- Wolf, Christopher. "These Countries Have Sent the Most Aid to Ukraine." *U.S. News*, February 24, 2023.
- YouGov. "What Should Happen to Trident at the End of Its Useful Life?" Accessed March 9, 2023. <https://yougov.co.uk/topics/economy/trackers/what-should-happen-to-trident-at-the-end-of-its-useful-life>.
- Yazigioglu, Ezgi. "A Look upon Turkey's Future Nuclear Weapons Policy." *Institut de Relations Internationales et Stratégiques*, September 25, 2019.
- Zala, Benjamin and Andrew Futter, "Strategic non-nuclear weapons and the onset of a Third Nuclear Age." *European Journal of International Security* 6, no. 3 (2021), 1-21.

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Alexander Høgsberg Tetzlaff is major in the Army and a military analyst at the Centre for Military Studies. In addition, he holds a master's degree in public governance from Copenhagen Business School. He has previously worked in the Ministry of Defence and Royal Danish Defence College. Alexander's primary research areas include security and defence policy, as well as emergency preparedness and societal security.

Dr Cornelia Baciú is researcher at the Centre for Military Studies, Department of Political Science, University of Copenhagen. Previously she was a lecturer and postdoctoral fellow at the Institute for Peace Research and Security Policy at the University of Hamburg and at Johns Hopkins University in Washington, DC. Cornelia Baciú specialized in international security organizations, normative orders and conflict research.

